

Table: MCA Assessment Framework

X	✓	✓✓	✓✓✓
Ineffective in satisfying project objective and criteria.	Minimally effective in satisfying the project objective and criteria.	Somewhat effective in satisfying the project objective and criteria.	Extremely effective in satisfying the project objective and criteria.

	OPTION 1 Status Quo	OPTION 2 Replace on New Site	OPTION 3 Replace on Existing Site	OPTION 4 Revitalize	OPTION 5 Repair
OBJECTIVE 1: Preserve and protect BC’s heritage by providing a safe and accessible facility					
a) Museum facilities effectively care for, preserve and protect British Columbia’s collection and archives from environmental degradation, seismic and flood risk	<p>✓</p> <p>Existing facilities generally do not have appropriate environmental conditions and controls for proper preservation and protection of the collection and archives, resulting in expedited deterioration of artifacts (only two galleries have been upgraded to provide appropriate conditions).</p> <p>On site collections are generally at risk of loss due to very poor seismic resistance of the facilities in which they are stored and displayed (see criteria 1b). Collections stored in the basement level are</p>	<p>✓✓✓</p> <p>New facilities would be designed to meet current Building Code requirements (including seismic and flood prevention) and satisfy appropriate environmental controls to preserve and protect the collection and archives and to prevent further deterioration of artifacts.</p> <p>New facilities would collectively allow the Museum to improve the services it provides to the Province through better sharing of the collection and archives, improved preservation</p>	<p>✓✓✓</p> <p>New facilities would be designed to meet current Building Code requirements (including seismic and flood prevention) and satisfy appropriate environmental controls to preserve and protect the collection and archives and to prevent further deterioration of artifacts.</p> <p>New facilities would collectively allow the Museum to improve the services it provides to the Province through better sharing of the collection and archives, improved preservation</p>	<p>✓✓</p> <p>New facilities would be designed to meet current Building Code requirements (including seismic and flood prevention) and satisfy appropriate environmental controls to preserve and protect the collection and archives and to prevent further deterioration of artifacts and archival material. The facilities would provide appropriately designed storage space with room to accommodate future growth of the collection.</p> <p>Existing facilities that are retained would be seismically</p>	<p>✓✓</p> <p>Existing facilities would be seismically upgraded and new HVAC systems installed to improve environmental conditions for preservation and protection of the collections and archives and to prevent any further deterioration of artifacts. (Note - it may be functionally and/or economically cost prohibitive to upgrade facilities to fully satisfy current Building Code requirements.)</p>

	OPTION 1 Status Quo	OPTION 2 Replace on New Site	OPTION 3 Replace on Existing Site	OPTION 4 Revitalize	OPTION 5 Repair
	<p>further exposed to risk by being below storm drainage elevations of the surrounding streets (e.g. vault containing Emily Carr paintings is below street drainage levels).</p> <p>In addition, the Museum has a sewage lift station in the basement without redundancy or a backup system in the event of failure.</p>	<p>capabilities and accessibility, all enabling service growth.</p>	<p>capabilities and accessibility, all enabling service growth.</p>	<p>upgraded and new HVAC systems installed to improve environmental conditions for preservation of the collections and archives. (Note - it may be functionally and/or economically cost prohibitive to upgrade facilities to fully satisfy current Building Code requirements.)</p> <p>New and upgraded facilities would collectively allow the Museum to improve the services it provides to the Province through better sharing of the collection and archives, improved preservation capabilities and accessibility, all enabling service growth.</p>	
<p>b) Museum facilities are safe and accessible for students, staff and public use</p>	<p>✓</p> <p>Existing facilities are unsafe from a seismic perspective putting all users at risk, with the main buildings having the following seismic capacity relative to Building Code requirements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Archives 5% capacity ▪ Fannin 6% capacity ▪ IMAX 20% capacity 	<p>✓✓✓</p> <p>New facilities would be designed to meet current Building Code requirements (e.g. assembly space loadings, seismic design, accessibility) to ensure safety and accessibility for all users visiting the Museum.</p> <p>The replacement project would also incorporate technology innovations to greatly improve digital access to the collection</p>	<p>✓✓✓</p> <p>New facilities would be designed to meet current Building Code requirements (e.g. assembly space loadings, seismic design, accessibility) to ensure safety and accessibility for all users visiting the Museum.</p> <p>The replacement project would also incorporate technology innovations to greatly improve digital access to the collection</p>	<p>✓✓</p> <p>New facilities would be designed to meet current Building Code requirements (e.g. assembly space loadings, seismic design, accessibility) to ensure safety and accessibility for all users visiting the Museum precinct.</p> <p>Existing facilities that are retained would be seismically upgraded with new vertical transportation links (stairwells,</p>	<p>✓✓</p> <p>Existing facilities that are retained would be seismically upgraded with new vertical transportation links (stairwells, escalators and elevators) to address safety and physical accessibility challenges. (Note - it may be functionally and/or economically cost prohibitive to upgrade facilities to fully satisfy current Building Code requirements.)</p>

	OPTION 1 Status Quo	OPTION 2 Replace on New Site	OPTION 3 Replace on Existing Site	OPTION 4 Revitalize	OPTION 5 Repair
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Exhibition Hall 25% capacity <p>In addition, non-structural building elements and exhibitions are not seismically restrained and therefore are subject to overturning or collapse in the event of an earthquake.</p> <p>Accessibility is an ongoing challenge within the existing facilities, due to elevator speed and capacity (single public elevator to access gallery spaces) and limited accessibility to mezzanine levels within the galleries. The reference room in the basement is not accessible to the public without an escort through secure areas.</p>	and archives for students, staff and the public both around the province and beyond BC's borders.	and archives for students, staff and the public both around the province and beyond BC's borders.	escalators and elevators) to address safety and physical accessibility challenges. (Note - it may be functionally and/or economically cost prohibitive to upgrade facilities to fully satisfy current Building Code requirements.) The design would also incorporate technology innovations to greatly improve digital access to the collection and archives for students, staff and the public both around the province and beyond BC's borders.	Building upgrades may be able to incorporate technology innovations to greatly improve digital access to the collection and archives for students, staff and the public both around the province and beyond BC's borders.
OBJECTIVE 2: Educate the public about BC's rich cultural, social and natural history					
a) Museum provides exceptional and wide reaching research and learning opportunities about BC's cultural, social and natural history	<p style="text-align: center;">✓</p> <p>Research work is presently undertaken behind the scenes, and not generally available to the public.</p> <p>Due to space limitations, the Museum does not have a dedicated learning space. RBCM is presently fundraising</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓✓</p> <p>A replacement project would create more opportunities for research and learning in an environment that is not limited by its walls. As an educational hub, the new Museum would create more educational spaces including digital platforms to</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓✓</p> <p>A replacement project would create more opportunities for research and learning in an environment that is not limited by its walls. As an educational hub, the new Museum would create more educational spaces including digital platforms to</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓✓</p> <p>A revitalized site would create more opportunities for research and learning in an environment that is not limited by its walls. As an educational hub, the Museum would create more educational spaces including digital platforms to enable the</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓</p> <p>Without provision of additional space, the repaired facilities would be challenged to provide exceptional research and learning opportunities on site without compromising other aspects of RBCM's programs.</p>

	OPTION 1 Status Quo	OPTION 2 Replace on New Site	OPTION 3 Replace on Existing Site	OPTION 4 Revitalize	OPTION 5 Repair
	to build a Learning Centre to create new opportunities for visitors to connect with programs, exhibitions and collections to deepen the visitor experience and understanding of BC's history. This includes remote online access to the Learning Centre and educational programs for the community to build the best in experiential education for British Columbians.	enable the sharing of BC's history both with visitors on site and around the province, so that geography is no longer a barrier to accessing our history	enable the sharing of BC's history both with visitors on site and around the province, so that geography is no longer a barrier to accessing our history.	sharing of BC's history both with visitors on site and around the province, so that geography is no longer a barrier to accessing our history. Implementation of a digital platform that enables the sharing of BC's history with public from around the province would improve current research and learning opportunities from afar so that geography is no longer a barrier to accessing our history.	
b) Increased exhibition and education space supports an enriched visitor experience, providing access to the Museum's working environment, on-going research, collections storage and archive materials	X Maintaining status quo does not support an enriched visitor experience. Space limitations and building design do not allow for public access to the Museum's working environment and research activities, or viewing of the vast majority of the collections and archive materials in storage.	✓✓ The replacement project would offer increased exhibition and education space, supporting a refreshed and enriched visitor experience. Purpose-built facilities would be designed to enable access to the Museum's working environment, on-going research, collections storage and archive materials. The prominence of the new site location may hinder the visitor experience to the extent that location of the Museum is less intuitive than the existing site,	✓✓✓ The replacement project would offer increased exhibition and education space, supporting a refreshed and enriched visitor experience. Purpose-built facilities would be designed to enable access to the Museum's working environment, on-going research, collections storage and archive materials. The prominence of the existing site location enhances the visitor experience given its location on the inner harbour, ideally suited to walk-up foot traffic.	✓✓✓ A revitalized site would offer increased exhibition and education space, in both new and renovated facilities, supporting a refreshed and enriched visitor experience. New facilities would be purpose-built and designed to enable access to the Museum's working environment, on-going research, collections storage and archive materials with integral linkages to existing, upgraded buildings.	X Repaired facilities would not offer increased space. While greatly improving the safety and accessibility issues the Museum experiences, the repairs are not targeted at enriching the visitor experience. Space limitations and building design do not allow for public access to the Museum's working environment and research activities, or viewing of the vast majority of the collections and archival materials in storage.

	OPTION 1 Status Quo	OPTION 2 Replace on New Site	OPTION 3 Replace on Existing Site	OPTION 4 Revitalize	OPTION 5 Repair
		potentially reducing walk-up foot traffic. The new site would NOT have a direct connection to Thunderbird Park.	Replacement on the existing site also maintains the direct connection to Thunderbird Park.		
OBJECTIVE 3: Advance Truth and Reconciliation and United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP)					
a) Museum demonstrates commitment to the Truth and Reconciliation Calls to Action (TRC) and the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples	✓ Existing facilities have limited space to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> enable and showcase reconciliation projects; allow Indigenous Peoples to research and honour ancestral remains and burial items; view cultural objects or other archival materials in a private room; listen to audio recordings of songs and ceremonies; and house large private community gatherings for Indigenous groups to undertake private research of their cultural belongings and intangible cultural heritage. 	✓✓✓ New facilities would be designed to incorporate Indigenous world views and knowledge in the storage, conservation and display of Indigenous collections and archival material and would dedicate space to reconciliation commemoration projects (TRC #68). They would also provide for a large private community space for Indigenous groups to gather and collaborate as well as undertake private research of their cultural belongings and intangible cultural heritage (TRC #69). In collaboration with Indigenous groups, private sacred spaces would be created to:	✓✓✓ New facilities would be designed to incorporate Indigenous world views and knowledge in the storage, conservation and display of Indigenous collections and archival material and would dedicate space to reconciliation commemoration projects (TRC #68). They would also provide for a large private community space for Indigenous groups to gather and collaborate as well as undertake private research of their cultural belongings and intangible cultural heritage (TRC #69). In collaboration with Indigenous groups, private sacred spaces would be created to:	✓✓✓ New facilities would be designed to incorporate Indigenous world views and knowledge in the storage, conservation and display of Indigenous collections and archival material and would dedicate space to reconciliation commemoration projects (TRC #68). They would also provide for a large community and programming space for Indigenous groups to gather and collaborate as well as undertake private research of their cultural belongings and intangible cultural heritage (TRC #69). In collaboration with Indigenous groups, private sacred spaces would be created to:	✓ Existing facilities have limited space to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> enable and showcase reconciliation projects; allow Indigenous Peoples to research and honour ancestral remains and burial items; view cultural objects or other archival materials in a private room; listen to audio recordings of songs and ceremonies; and house large private community gatherings for Indigenous groups to undertake private research of their cultural belongings and intangible cultural heritage.

	OPTION 1 Status Quo	OPTION 2 Replace on New Site	OPTION 3 Replace on Existing Site	OPTION 4 Revitalize	OPTION 5 Repair
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> allow Indigenous Peoples to honour ancestral remains and burial items; view cultural objects or other archival material; listen to audio recordings of songs and ceremonies; and conduct ceremonies from smudging to praying, singing, dancing or making offering to a fire. <p>In consultation with Indigenous groups, new facilities would ensure that a proper mortuary house (grave house) is built to store and honour ancestral remains and burial items in a more respectful way (UNDRIP articles 11 & 12).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> allow Indigenous Peoples to honour ancestral remains and burial items; view cultural objects or other archival material; listen to audio recordings of songs and ceremonies; and conduct ceremonies from smudging to praying, singing, dancing or making offering to a fire. <p>In consultation with Indigenous groups, new facilities would ensure that a proper mortuary house (grave house) is built to store and honour ancestral remains and burial items in a more respectful way (UNDRIP articles 11 & 12).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> allow Indigenous Peoples to honour ancestral remains and burial items; view cultural objects or other archival material; listen to audio recordings of songs and ceremonies; and conduct ceremonies from smudging to praying, singing, dancing or making offering to a fire. <p>In consultation with Indigenous groups, new facilities would ensure that a proper mortuary house (grave house) is built to be able to store and honour ancestral remains and burial items in a more respectful way (UNDRIP articles 11 & 12).</p>	Repairs to the facilities would not increase program or exhibition space.
b) Museum works equitably and collaboratively with Indigenous peoples to advance repatriation and cooperative management of Indigenous cultural collections, intangible cultural heritage and	<p style="text-align: center;">✓</p> <p>Museum would continue to consult with Indigenous peoples to the extent that they can, in a limited fashion. Existing space limits the opportunity for collaboration.</p> <p>Existing facilities do not have a proper mortuary house to store and honour ancestral remains</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓</p> <p>New facilities would be designed in consultation with Indigenous peoples to incorporate Indigenous world views and knowledge in the storage, conservation and display of Indigenous collections and archival material.</p> <p>New facilities would provide for collaborative opportunities to</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓✓</p> <p>New facilities would be designed in consultation with Indigenous peoples to incorporate Indigenous world views and knowledge in the storage, conservation and display of Indigenous collections and archival material.</p> <p>New facilities would provide for collaborative opportunities to</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓✓</p> <p>New facilities would be designed in consultation with Indigenous peoples to incorporate Indigenous world views and knowledge in the storage, conservation and display of Indigenous collections and archival material.</p> <p>New facilities would provide for collaborative opportunities to</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓</p> <p>Repaired facilities may provide an opportunity to rearrange the storage of the collections by nation, and would allow for a degree of consultation in re-planning of renovated spaces.</p> <p>Museum would continue to consult with Indigenous peoples to the extent that they can, in a limited fashion.</p>

	OPTION 1 Status Quo	OPTION 2 Replace on New Site	OPTION 3 Replace on Existing Site	OPTION 4 Revitalize	OPTION 5 Repair
ancestral remains in its care	<p>and burial items in a respectful way.</p> <p>Private research space is not available to accommodate large Indigenous groups to research their cultural belongings and intangible cultural heritage.</p> <p>The existing facilities do not allow for display and storage of larger cultural items (canoes, totem poles) on site due to lack of space, ceiling height limitations of storage areas, and floor loading weight restrictions.</p>	<p>engage nations in making more of the collection visible and accessible, including provision of a ceremony(ies) with the transfer of the collections, archives and ancestral remains to the new site.</p> <p>Design would allow for collaborative creation of new Indigenous exhibits, accommodating display and storage of larger cultural items (canoes, totem poles) on site.</p> <p>New facilities would ensure that a proper mortuary house is built to store and honour ancestral remains and burial items in a more respectful way.</p> <p>The new site would NOT have a direct connection to Thunderbird Park, dividing the visitor experience.</p>	<p>engage nations in making more of the collection visible and accessible, including provision of a ceremony(ies) with the transfer of the collections, archives and ancestral remains to the new museum.</p> <p>Design would allow for collaborative creation of new Indigenous exhibits, accommodating display and storage of larger cultural items (canoes, totem poles) on site.</p> <p>New facilities would ensure that a proper mortuary house is built to store and honour ancestral remains and burial items in a more respectful way.</p> <p>The existing site would maintain a direct connection to Thunderbird Park.</p>	<p>engage nations in making more of the collection visible and accessible.</p> <p>Design would allow for collaborative creation of new Indigenous exhibits, accommodating display and storage of larger cultural items (canoes, totem poles) on site.</p> <p>New facilities would ensure that a proper mortuary house is built to store and honour ancestral remains and burial items in a more respectful way.</p>	<p>Existing facilities do not have a proper mortuary house to store and honour ancestral remains and burial items in a respectful way.</p> <p>Private research space is not available to accommodate large Indigenous groups to research their cultural belongings and intangible cultural heritage.</p> <p>The facilities could allow for display and storage of larger cultural items (canoes, totem poles) on site as a trade off with other program requirements.</p>

OBJECTIVE 4: Create a world class and sustainable provincial asset that drives the economy

<p>a) Project enables continuity of operations throughout construction and drives future revenue generation opportunities</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓</p> <p>Status quo ensures continuity of operations as there would be no impact to operations as a result of construction; however, it does not drive any improvements towards future revenue generation opportunities.</p> <p>RBCM would continue to have limitations on the travelling exhibits that it may attract given its current facility deficiencies.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓✓</p> <p>With construction on a new site, operational impacts to the museum would be minimized to the greatest extent. Closures would be limited to the curating of exhibits and relocation of the collections and archives to the new facility.</p> <p>Revenues may still be generated during this period with early opening of program components such as a restaurant and gift shop. Continuity of operations could be maintained and staff retained.</p> <p>Purpose-built facilities would meet the size, environmental conditions and security requirements to attract world class travelling exhibits, driving future revenue growth.</p> <p>The prominence of the site location in the inner harbour attracts a significant amount of tourism and walk-up foot traffic. Relocation to another downtown location away from the inner harbour may affect walk-up foot traffic and tourism revenue and may significantly affect those revenues if moved out of the downtown core entirely.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓</p> <p>With construction on the existing site, operational impacts to the museum would be significant. Project implementation would be phased as existing buildings are demolished to create space for a new exhibition hall and collections storage buildings.</p> <p>The potential to keep portions of the site open to the public during construction would be assessed during business case development to determine the feasibility of the Museum continuing with modified operations (e.g. opening a temporary exhibit on a different site in Victoria or taking exhibits on tour around the province). Limited or no revenues may be generated during this period as a result. Tourism revenue within the Capital Regional District may also be significantly affected by closure of the Museum during construction.</p> <p>Purpose-built facilities would meet the size, environmental conditions and security requirements to attract world class travelling exhibits, driving future revenue growth.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓</p> <p>Project implementation would be phased to moderate operational impacts and remain open during construction. Seismic upgrades would impact operations as certain portions of the buildings would need to be temporarily closed through the process.</p> <p>The potential to keep portions of the site open to the public during construction would be assessed during business case development to determine the feasibility of the Museum continuing with modified operations (e.g. opening a temporary exhibit on a different site in Victoria or taking exhibits on tour around the province).</p> <p>Purpose-built facilities would meet the size, environmental conditions and security requirements to attract world class travelling exhibits, driving future revenue growth.</p> <p>Re-planning the existing site to take advantage of commercial opportunities may provide funding and revenue generation from other sources (e.g. rental income).</p> <p>The prominence of the site location in the inner harbour</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓</p> <p>Repair of the existing facilities without creation of any net new space would require phased decanting of the site to allow renovation work to proceed.</p> <p>Seismic upgrades would impact operations as certain portions of the buildings would need to be temporarily closed through the process.</p> <p>The above work would be significantly invasive to all buildings and would disrupt continuity of operations, even with thoughtful phasing.</p> <p>Major renovations may allow relocation of commercial operations to provide better revenue generation opportunities (e.g. gift shop, restaurant, variable ticket pricing)</p>
---	---	---	---	---	--

	OPTION 1 Status Quo	OPTION 2 Replace on New Site	OPTION 3 Replace on Existing Site	OPTION 4 Revitalize	OPTION 5 Repair
			<p>Re-planning the existing site to take advantage of commercial opportunities may provide funding and revenue generation from other sources (e.g. rental income).</p> <p>The prominence of the site location in the inner harbour and its ability to attract a significant amount of tourism and walk-up foot traffic makes future commercial opportunities on the site attractive.</p>	<p>and its ability to attract a significant amount of tourism and walk-up foot traffic makes future commercial opportunities on the site attractive.</p>	

	OPTION 1 Status Quo	OPTION 2 Replace on New Site	OPTION 3 Replace on Existing Site	OPTION 4 Revitalize	OPTION 5 Repair
b) Project leverages non-provincial funding opportunities to support redevelopment	<p style="text-align: center;">✓</p> <p>With status quo, the Museum would continue to seek non-provincial funding for operations to supplement its revenue stream from ticket sales and provincial operating grant.</p> <p>In addition, the Museum would continue to fundraise towards implementation of the Learning Centre project.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓✓</p> <p>Moving the Museum to a new site provides an opportunity for land disposal of the current precinct, excluding Thunderbird Park, which would offset a portion of the costs of the project.</p> <p>A replacement project may be a candidate for the Investing in Canada Plan, which includes the federal government making investments in cultural and recreational infrastructure (e.g. Green Infrastructure – Disaster Mitigation and Adaptation Fund).</p> <p>Replacement would provide an opportunity for a significant capital philanthropy campaign to attract private donors.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓✓</p> <p>Re-planning the site to take advantage of market development opportunities could provide one-time funding from property sales or ongoing funding through rental income.</p> <p>A replacement project may be a candidate for the Investing in Canada Plan, which includes the federal government making investments in cultural and recreational infrastructure (e.g. Green Infrastructure – Disaster Mitigation and Adaptation Fund).</p> <p>Replacement would provide an opportunity for a significant capital philanthropy campaign to attract private donors.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓✓</p> <p>Re-planning the site to take advantage of market development opportunities could provide one-time funding from property sales or ongoing funding through rental income.</p> <p>A revitalization project would be a candidate for the Investing in Canada Plan, which includes the federal government making investments in cultural and recreational infrastructure (e.g. Green Infrastructure – Disaster Mitigation and Adaptation Fund).</p> <p>Revitalization would provide an opportunity for a significant capital philanthropy campaign to attract private donors.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">✓✓</p> <p>Repair of the existing facilities would not take advantage of market development opportunities that could provide one-time funding from property sales or ongoing funding through rental income.</p> <p>A repair project would be a candidate for the Investing in Canada Plan, which includes the federal government making investments in cultural and recreational infrastructure (e.g. Green Infrastructure – Disaster Mitigation and Adaptation Fund).</p> <p>A repair project substantially reduces the opportunity for a capital philanthropy campaign to attract private donors over new construction.</p>