Minister of Agriculture's Advisory Council on Finfish Aquaculture

Minutes of Meeting

October 25 & 26, 2016

Agenda Item

1. Welcome and Review Agenda

John Bones (Vice-Chair) welcomed MAACFA members to the meeting and provided a brief overview of the agenda. The Vice-Chair welcomed new member Keith Atleo.

The meeting agenda along with a list of those attending the meeting is attached.

2. MAACFA Membership Update

Deputy Minister Sturko provided an update on MAACFA membership. Dallas Smith has stepped down as a council member and Keith Atleo has been appointed. The Minister of Agriculture has given Mr. Sturko approval to approach additional First Nations individuals about joining MAACFA. It is anticipated that additional First Nations members will be identified, briefed and be in attendance at the next MAACFA meeting -- December 12/13, 2016.

Mr. Sturko provided an update on timelines. The council's terms of reference stipulate that MAACFA will report to the Minister on progress within 100 days of establishment. In light of membership changes, MAACFA may take additional time to complete its progress report. During the July 5, 2016 MAACFA meeting Mr. Sturko had encouraged the council to complete its final report by June 2017. Given concerns raised by some MAACFA members, Mr. Sturko clarified that the council's terms of reference allow for a final report within 18 months of the terms of reference being endorsed (i.e., by the end of 2017).

3. Meeting Minutes

The September 21/22, 2016 draft meeting minutes were discussed and approved.

4. Presentations

The council heard five presentations on "Perspectives" topics, with brief question and answer periods on each. All of the written presentations made to the council on October 25, 2016 are attached. Also, a summary of key points from the presentations will be incorporated into a MAACFA rolling draft report for review by council members.

First Nations Fisheries Council Presentation

Richard Hardy made a presentation on behalf of the First Nations Fisheries Council (FNFC). The FNFC has an Aquaculture Coordinating Committee comprised of members drawn from 14 regions covering the entire province of BC.

Kitasoo/Xaixais First Nation Presentation

Larry Greba made a presentation behalf of the Kitasoo/Xaixais First Nation. This presentation was a case study describing the Kitasoo/Xaixais First Nation involvement in aquaculture, including community priorities, best practices and environmental measures.

Environmental NGO Presentation

Dr. Craig Orr made a presentation on behalf of the Watershed Watch Salmon Society. This presentation focused on sea lice and included data from British Columbia and other jurisdictions. Referring to data from British Columbia, the presentation described research in the Broughton Archipelago.

Community Presentation

Mayor Hank Bood made a presentation of behalf of the District of Port Hardy. This presentation described the evolution of the salmon farming industry on northern Vancouver Island and the contribution it makes to the local economy.

Aquaculture Industry Presentation

Jeremy Dunn made a presentation on behalf of the BC Salmon Farmer's Association (BCSFA). The BCSFA represents seven companies operating ocean farms at 112 sites as well as nine companies operating land-based farms at 20 sites.

5. Discussion of Presentations From Previous Day

The Vice-Chair summarized the proceedings of Day 1 and discussed one issue that had arisen in the questioning of a presenter. It was suggested that future presenters be advised that they should anticipate pointed questions from MAACFA members and encouraged to not view questions as criticism of their work or person. The Council needs to understand the scope of issues and the points of agreement and disagreement.

Paul Macgillivray summarized the presentations made on Day 1, and identified key points that he had documented from the presentations and follow-up questions. Council members exchanged views and added additional points. The Vice-Chair confirmed that the key points and the summary of presentations would be added to the rolling draft report which will be discussed at the next MAACFA meeting. MAACFA members can access the rolling draft report at the council's SharePoint site.

6. Approach to Address Identified Topics

The draft chart organizing the work of MAACFA was discussed. MAACFA members identified additional topics and potential presenters for specific topics of interest. These are reflected in the attached updated version of the chart. MAACFA members are interested in hearing from at least one other community (in addition to Port Hardy) to gain an understanding of different points of view and alternative community perspectives on aquaculture.

A suggestion was made that MAACFA members identify individuals who they would like presentations from well in advance of the presentations. This would allow those individuals to work on their presentations with the certainty that they will present. During this discussion MAACFA members agreed that they would like to hear from Dr. Marvin Rosenau, and that Ministry of Agriculture support staff will contact him and other presenters.

In addition, MAACFA members reiterated their interest in receiving written material (e.g., the 10 public reviews addressing salmon farming during the past 15 years and any DFO briefs on science provided to the Senate Standing Committee). It was noted that having access to written material may reduce the need for some presentations.

Council members expressed concern that the intended current approach of hearing from all nominated presenters and only listing points to discuss, does not provide sufficient opportunity to debate key points and advance the development of a final report. A

discussion occurred on how to address these issues. It was agreed that the general approach for the next meetings would be to expedite completion of the "perspectives" presentations but also spend time reviewing the rolling draft report and initiating discussion on some of the key points identified in it. This approach would make the selection of future presenters easier, as it would reflect the need to get more information on issues that arise as a result of the debate on key points.

7. Follow-up from July and October Meetings

Larry Greba made a presentation on behalf of First Nation MAACFA members concerning First Nations' interests in aquaculture. These included:

- recognition and respect for First Nations title and rights;
- protection of eco-system and access to traditional foods;
- actions consistent with case law;
- ongoing development/refinement of collaborative governance processes;
- encourage First Nations economic development;
- support and build First Nations capacity; and,
- Right of each First Nation to choose if salmon farming should occur in their territory.

Larry Greba was requested to advise the Chair/Vice-Chair of which of the topics identified in the slides would be the most appropriate for presentation as additional First Nations "perspectives." In this context, MAACFA members expressed an interest in exploring further what has worked, what has not worked, what risks First Nations are concerned about and what role science can play to help inform decisions, as the basis for a presentation at the December MAACFA meeting.

Larry Greba was also requested by the Vice-Chair to confirm which of his presentation material (if any) could be added to the rolling draft report.

8. Next Steps

The next MAACFA meeting will be on December 12/13, 2016 at the Coast Bastian Hotel in Nanaimo. It was agreed that the agenda for this meeting would include presentations on the following topics: (i) additional First Nations perspectives on salmon farming; (ii) salmon biology and ecology and (iii) fish health, risks associated with salmon farming, including diseases.

After these presentations, the agenda for the December MAACFA meeting would include time to review a first rolling draft report that includes background and key questions/points raised to date, followed by commencement of exchange of views on key questions/points in the draft report.

The council also discussed the January 2017 MAACFA meeting. It was generally agreed that the same format approach should be used as recommended for the December meeting, with the selection of presenters more closely associated with council debate on key issues already identified.

The council discussed the requirement to submit a progress report to the Minister. ADM James Mack clarified that the Minister is currently looking for an affirmation that the council is operating effectively and is on track with its work. The progress report will be discussed in more detail at the December 2016 meeting.

Attachments

October 25 and 26, 2016 Meeting Agenda and Meeting Attendance

Draft Work Plan Chart - Proposed Approach to Topics Identified by Council Members

Presentations

- *First Nations Fisheries Council Aquaculture Coordinating Committee Presentation to Ministry of Agriculture Advisory Council on Finfish Aquaculture, October 25, 2016* (Richard Hardy)
- *Salmon Farming and the Kitasoo/Xaixais Nation "The Business of Sustainability"* (Larry Greba)
- *Brief Overview of Farmed-Wild Salmon Interactions With Respect to Sea Lice (*Craig Orr*)*
- *Salmon Aquaculture in BC (*Jeremy Dunn)

Minister of Agriculture's Advisory Council on Finfish Aquaculture

Draft Meeting Agenda

Date: *October 25 & 26, 2016*

Time: *Meeting begins at 10 a.m. on Tuesday October 25th and ends at noon on Wednesday October 26th*

Location: **Coast Bastion Hotel, Nanaimo**

Tuesday October 25, 2016

Coffee Available at 9.30 am -- Meeting Begins at 10 am

Agenda Item

1. Welcome and Review Agenda	**John Bones (Vice-Chair)**
2. MAACFA Membership Update	
• **Membership Changes**	**Derek Sturko**
• **Introduction of new MAACFA member**	**Keith Atleo**
3. Meeting Minutes	**Roundtable Discussion**
• **Approval of September 21/22, 2016 meeting minutes**	
4. First Nations Presentations	
• **First Nations Fisheries Council**	**Richard Hardy**
• **Kitasoo First Nation**	**Larry Greba**

LUNCH

5. Environmental NGO Presentation	
• **Watershed Watch**	**Craig Orr**

6. **Community Presentation**
   - **District of Port Hardy** — **Mayor Bood**

7. **Aquaculture Industry Presentation**
   - **BC Salmon Farmer's Association** — **Jeremy Dunn**

END OF DAY 1

Wednesday October 26, 2016

Coffee Available at 8.00 am -- Meeting Begins at 8.30 am

8. **Discussion of Presentations From Previous Day** — **Roundtable Discussion**
   - **Exchange views regarding key points**
   - **Synopsis of MAACFA observations for possible inclusion in final report**

Coffee

9. **Follow-up from July and October Meetings** — **First Nation Members**
   - **Hear from First Nation MAACFA members on how the Council might approach First Nations' interests in its work**

10. **Approach to Address Identified Topics** — **John Bones**
    - **Review Draft Chart – Discuss steps and schedule leading to preparation of final report** — **Roundtable Discussion**

11. **Next Steps** — **John Bones**
    - **MAACFA report to the Minister on progress**
    - **Summary of Meeting and Review Action Items**
    - **Confirm Next MAACFA Meeting and Agenda**

MEETING AJOURNS AT NOON

October 25 and 26, 2016 MAACFA Meeting Attendance

MAACFA Members in Attendance

Tony Allard
Keith Atleo
John Bones (Vice-Chair)
Christina Burridge
Jeremy Dunn
Anthony Farrell
Larry Greba
Richard Harry
Saya Masso
Don Noakes
Brian Riddell
Tessa Terbasket
John Werring
Derek Sturko (BC government member)
Sharon Hadway (October 25th - BC government)
Craig Sutherland (October 26th - BC government)

Regrets

Paul Sprout (Chair)

MAACFA Secretariat

James Mack
Jim Russell

Contractor Supporting MAACFA

Paul Macgillivray