The Dog and Cat Breeding Industry in B.C.

Consultation Summary Report

Prepared by Corporate Governance, Policy & Legislation
BC Ministry of Agriculture
June, 2016
Introduction .............................................................................................................................................. 4
Consultation results .................................................................................................................................. 4
Question 1: Are you a resident of British Columbia? .............................................................................. 7
Question 2: Please choose the provincial development region where you reside. ................................. 7
Question 3: Do you currently breed dogs or cats to sell or exchange any of the offspring for money or
other form of compensation? .................................................................................................................. 8
Question 4: Which do you breed? ........................................................................................................... 8
Question 5: Please indicate the number of breeding females you would own in a typical year. .......... 9
Question 6: How often do you breed your females? ............................................................................... 10
Question 7: Do you breed dogs or cats using artificial insemination techniques? ............................... 11
Question 8: Do you import genetic material for the purposes of artificial insemination? ................... 11
Question 9: Please indicate the number of offspring you have sold or exchanged in the past twelve
months. .................................................................................................................................................. 12
Question 10: If this is not a typical twelve month period for you, please indicate the number of
offspring you have sold or exchanged in a typical year ......................................................................... 12
Question 11: Do you supply puppies and/or kittens to retail locations? .............................................. 13
Question 12: Are you a producer of puppies and/or kittens that are then sold by someone else, either
in the province or elsewhere? ............................................................................................................... 13
Question 13: Do you currently keep detailed records related to the puppies and/or kittens you
produce? ................................................................................................................................................ 14
Question 14: What records do you keep? (select all that apply) .......................................................... 14
Question 15: Are you a member of a dog or cat association, breed club or other animal organization?
(select all that apply) ............................................................................................................................. 15
Question 16: Do you follow pre-established standards of care, codes of practice or other generally
accepted management practices when providing care to your animals? ............................................. 16
Question 17: Which pre-established standards of care, codes of practice or other generally accepted
management practices in the care of your animals do you follow? ..................................................... 16
Question 18: Have you created your own breeding procedures or other operational procedures? ... 17
Question 19: On a scale of 1 (lowest) to 10 (highest), what is your level of concern about animal
welfare as it relates to the dog and cat breeding industry in B.C.? ....................................................... 17
Question 20: When thinking about your animal welfare concerns in the dog and cat breeding
industry, rank the following list to show where the B.C. government should put the most focus when
developing standards of care. ............................................................................................................... 18
Question 21: Do you have any other animal welfare concerns in the dog and cat breeding industry that are important to you, but did not appear on the list above? ............................................................ 18

Question 22: Do you agree or disagree with these potential advantages to creating regulatory standards of care for dog and cat breeders? ............................................................................. 19

Question 23: Do you agree or disagree with these potential disadvantages to creating regulatory standards of care for dog and cat breeders? ............................................................................. 20

Question 24: How do you think irresponsible breeders will be found? [select all that apply] .......... 21

Question 25: Are there higher risk breeder categories which require more oversight? ...................... 22

Question 26: In what ways will animal welfare at breeding establishments improve if British Columbia strengthens regulatory oversight of dog and cat breeding? ................................................................. 23

Question 27: What are the weaknesses of improving regulatory oversight of dog and cat breeding? 24

Question 28: Are you willing to pay for registration and/or licensing? ............................................. 25

Question 29: What is the maximum you would be willing to pay? ..................................................... 26

Question 30: In what ways will your breeding business be positively impacted by improving regulatory oversight of dog and cat breeding in British Columbia? ................................................................. 27

Question 31: In what ways will your breeding business be negatively impacted by improving regulatory oversight of dog and cat breeding in British Columbia? ................................................................. 28

Question 32: Thinking about your experiences, which concept would be most acceptable to dog and cat breeders in British Columbia? .......................................................................................................... 29

Question 33: What type of education and outreach works best for dog and cat breeders? ................ 29

Question 34: What is the best way to reach out to breeders who will be hesitant to implement mandatory standards of care? ......................................................................................................................... 30

Question 35: Which training topics related to improved regulatory oversight of breeders would be most important to you? ......................................................................................................................... 31

Question 36: Which animal welfare education topics, that could be offered in training sessions, are most important to dog and cat breeders? .......................................................................................... 32

Question 37: Which elements are the most important to include in public outreach campaigns? ..... 33

Question 38: Do you think your customers would be interested in seeing simplified reports on inspection outcomes? ............................................................................................................................ 34

Question 39: Do you think strengthening regulatory oversight of dog and cat breeders will improve the public’s ability to make good choices when selecting dogs and cats? ................................. 35

Question 40: Please provide new, additional comments you may have related to dog and cat breeding standards of care, a registration system and/or a licensing system. ........................................ 35
Introduction

On February 22, 2016, Premier Christy Clark announced that the B.C. government would adopt a regulation under the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act recognizing the Canadian Veterinary Medical Association’s (CVMA) Codes of Practice for both kennel and cattery operations as generally accepted management practices for cat and dog breeders in British Columbia.

Premier Clark also announced that the B.C. government had begun consultations with the BC SPCA and other key stakeholders to identify potential options that will assist the BC SPCA monitor and take action against irresponsible breeders of dogs and cats.

While reliable data on the size and scope of the dog and cat breeding industry in B.C. are unavailable at this time, estimates range from several hundred to several thousand purebred and non-purebred dog and cat breeders operating in B.C.

The B.C. Ministry of Agriculture (the Ministry) is exploring the following options to enhance the protection of animals at dog and cat breeding facilities:

- Introducing a mandatory registration or licensing system with defined standards of care criteria in order to operate as a breeder;
- Non-regulatory ideas to improve education, monitoring and enforcement among animal welfare authorities, breeders and the public.

The purpose of the consultation was to collect stakeholder input on the following topics:

- Ideas on impacts that licensing and/or registration may have on breeders.
- Potential proactive monitoring and enforcement measures for irresponsible dog and cat breeders.

The input received will be used to guide potential recommendations to government, in order to ensure consistent quality care, management and humane treatment of dogs and cats in all breeding establishments in British Columbia.

Consultation results

Phase two was conducted through an online survey, in order to ensure the maximum number of dog and cat breeders were provided the opportunity to share their views on how a potential licensing or registration system would impact their operations. The survey was available for comment from April 25 to May 20, 2016.

The Ministry received 454 responses in total to the online survey, then the survey refined respondents to those people who live in British Columbia and are either currently breeding dogs or cats, or had been a breeder in the past.

- 238 respondents indicated they currently breed dogs or cats
- 74 recently retired or ceased breeding
- 305 Breed dogs, 6 Breed cats, 2 breed both dogs and cats

The input from both phases was analysed and these common themes emerged:

- All respondents are generally supportive of doing something to stop irresponsible breeding and puppy/kitten mills.
- There is no consensus on which system could work better (licenses or registration) given the lack of details and the incorrect assumption that the province was just going to license all breeders. Some felt that improving existing laws or implementing existing laws in a better way would be sufficient.
- Inspection, compliance and enforcement are the only way any system will be effective at stopping irresponsible breeding.
- There is general concern that if the province over regulated breeders, good breeders would move elsewhere or give up their activity, which would result in an increase of profit-seeking, irresponsible breeders who would fill a supply gap.
- Monitoring and inspecting people who sell through pet stores, online, newspapers, and other advertising is a good way to find irresponsible breeders.
- Sales of puppies and kittens could be tracked and traced back to the original breeder if a new system included mandatory microchips or tattoos.
- Breeders are very knowledgeable about breeding and could be interested in participating in the future activities or forums related to creating a new system to stop irresponsible breeders.
- Commercial breeder as a term should be well defined and government should consider identifying hobby breeders or small scale breeders.
- Majority of breeders provide excellent care for their dogs and cats and already have very high standards of care, record keeping and buyer screening/sales contract procedures.
- Many breeders keep their animals in their homes and puppies and kittens are born in home.
- Creating new standards of care with flexible operational requirements, mandatory health/genetic tests, socialization and other areas would be preferred.
- Marks of irresponsible breeders are: profit seeking behaviour, sales through pet stores or other brokers, sub-standard health and/or environmental conditions, sub-standard animal care,
treatment and/or socialization, sub-standard breeding practices which lead to genetic defects or hereditary disorders, erroneous or falsified certificates of registration, pedigrees and/or genetic background.

- There are many public education and outreach programs delivered by many different stakeholders on all aspects of pet ownership, including how to select a breeder, questions to ask, how to be a responsible pet owner and others.

- Local governments would require assistance to either reconcile existing by-laws or to transition away from by-laws.

The results of all forty questions from the online survey are presented along with a categorization of common themes from the open text responses to those questions that offered that option.
Question 1: Are you a resident of British Columbia?

*Total responses = 454

- Yes: 91%
- No: 9%

Question 2: Please choose the provincial development region where you reside.

*Total responses = 405

- Mainland / Southwest: 37.3%
- Vancouver Island / Coast: 35.6%
- Thompson / Okanagan: 15.3%
- Cariboo: 4.4%
- Kootenay: 4.0%
- Northeast: 1.5%
- North Coast: 1.2%
- Nechako: 0.7%
Question 3: Do you currently breed dogs or cats to sell or exchange any of the offspring for money or other form of compensation?

*Total responses = 395

Question 4: Which do you breed?

*Total responses = 313
Question 5: Please indicate the number of breeding females you would own in a typical year.

'Typical year' means what you would consider your normal business conditions as a breeder, and could include past years if you are not actively breeding.

*Total responses = 302

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2 - 3</td>
<td>36.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>30.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 - 5</td>
<td>9.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 - 10</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 - 15</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other amount or you own both males and females (please specify quantity)</td>
<td>14.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The ‘Other amount, please specify’ category resulted in 46 free text comments from respondents; the summary of results indicates several common themes as:

- 30 respondents own male and female animals, owning both sexes does not imply breeding.
- 8 indicate a complicated arrangement, including: co-ownership, co-breeding, multiple animals in waiting to determine full health tests and/or breeding potential and males and females of various status (active breeding, retired, very young).
- Age of female at time of breeding, e.g. waiting until at least 2 years of age, is indicated as important factor in planning.
**Question 6: How often do you breed your females?**

*Total responses = 283*

The *other, please specify* category resulted in 91 responses, note that the decision to breed is highly individualistic and many of the responses contain multiple answers. The summary of results indicates most common themes as:

- 37 consider multiple, animal specific factors when deciding to breed a female, including: age, fitness, results of health/genetic tests, temperament, litter sizes, show results, adequate homes, new show dog, appropriate stud available, number of previous litters, show schedule. 16 consider breeding only after all appropriate health and/or genetic testing is complete.
- 12 decide in part based on a limited number of litters per lifetime, ranges from 1-4 litters.
- 14 decide in part based on frequency, ranges from every year to every five years.
- 5 decide in part based on producing next show dogs for them.
Question 7: Do you breed dogs or cats using artificial insemination techniques?

*Total responses = 296

![Bar chart](image)

The *other, please specify* category resulted in 45 responses, the summary of results indicates most common themes as:

- 35 would use it sometimes or occasionally, especially if it meant improving the gene pool.
- Some are planning to do it in the future, or would do it to achieve pregnancy.
- Some are not opposed to it, or feel that it depends on your situation and what options you have available.

Question 8: Do you import genetic material for the purposes of artificial insemination?

*Total responses = 296

![Bar chart](image)

The *other, please specify* category resulted in 28 responses, the summary of results indicates most common themes as:

- 14 indicate they have imported semen sometimes or occasionally.
- 11 indicate that they plan to do so or there are factors to consider when making the decision.
- Some felt the question was poorly worded and did not understand the question.
- Collecting semen from tom cats and impregnating queens is rare and may not be done in BC.
Question 9: Please indicate the number of offspring you have sold or exchanged in the past twelve months.

*Total responses = 295

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Offspring</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>40.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 - 10</td>
<td>43.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 - 20</td>
<td>8.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 - 30</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 - 40</td>
<td>0.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41 - 50</td>
<td>1.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51 - 60</td>
<td>0.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71 - 80</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81 - 90</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The *other, please specify* category resulted in 9 responses, respondents either indicate a very small number of puppies sold or a small number of litters in their active breeding period.

Question 10: If this is not a typical twelve month period for you, please indicate the number of offspring you have sold or exchanged in a typical year.

'Typical year' means what you would consider your normal business conditions as a breeder, and could include past years if you are not actively breeding.

*total responses = 118

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Offspring</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>15.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 - 10</td>
<td>68.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 - 20</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 - 30</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The *other, please specify* category resulted in 11 responses where respondents indicate the following: there is no such thing as a ‘typical year’ when having puppies, a very small number of puppies sold or a small number of litters in their active breeding period.
Question 11: Do you supply puppies and/or kittens to retail locations?

*total responses = 291

The other, please specify category resulted in 12 responses where respondents state that selling in a retail pet store is against all club rules and it would never happen.

Question 12: Are you a producer of puppies and/or kittens that are then sold by someone else, either in the province or elsewhere?

*total responses = 291

The other, please specify category resulted in 9 responses where respondents state that it is unethical, contrary to breeding contracts, future owners are hand selected, or is against club rules. One respondent states they provide semen to breeding female owners and shares in profit from resulting puppies.
Question 13: Do you currently keep detailed records related to the puppies and/or kittens you produce?

*total responses = 291

![Graph showing 97.6% Yes and 2.4% No]

Question 14: What records do you keep? (select all that apply)

*total responses = 280

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Record Type</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date, time of birth</td>
<td>99.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent information</td>
<td>98.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Details of who is buying</td>
<td>94.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Condition at birth</td>
<td>86.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mortality information, including still births</td>
<td>83.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of litters per year per female</td>
<td>82.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genetic traits</td>
<td>81.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personality/behaviour traits</td>
<td>74.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deformities</td>
<td>69.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Close line breeding information</td>
<td>67.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The ‘other, please specify’ category contained 97 responses. The summary of the main themes are:

- 21 stated they also keep all health test and genetic test records
- 19 stated they also keep very detailed and concise records of all aspects of puppies and copies are often provided to person buying the puppy.
- 19 stated registrations, microchip, and vaccinations records are kept.
- 11 stated they keep track of the health and many other aspects (show records, temperament) of puppies over the course of their lives after they are sold.
- 6 stated they keep parent, pedigree, stud records.
- 5 stated they keep legal sales agreements and legal stud agreement records.
- 4 stated they keep detailed records on each buyer and prospective buyer.
- The remaining comments ranged from: keeping competition records, abnormalities, pictures and weight gain/growth rates.

**Question 15: Are you a member of a dog or cat association, breed club or other animal organization?**
(select all that apply)

*total responses = 285*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Kennel Club</td>
<td>95.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Cat Association</td>
<td>48.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (please specify)</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, not applicable</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pet Industry Joint Advisory Council of Canada</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Mushers Association of BC</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The ‘other, please specify’ category contained 97 responses. The summary of the main themes are:

- 62 respondents identify breed clubs or other kennel club, often multiple, provincial, national, American and international.
- 47 respondents belong to multiple clubs (breeds, agility, training, sport, show, judging)
- 21 respondents identified belong to both Canadian and American breed clubs
- 6 respondents belong to The International Cat Association and Cat Fanciers Association.
- The remainder belonged to either informal clubs, or dog training clubs.
**Question 16:** Do you follow pre-established standards of care, codes of practice or other generally accepted management practices when providing care to your animals?

*total responses = 283

![Bar chart showing 97.2% Yes and 2.8% No responses.]

**Question 17:** Which pre-established standards of care, codes of practice or other generally accepted management practices in the care of your animals do you follow?

*total responses = 276

![Pie chart showing:
- A Code of Practice for Canadian Cattery Operations, First edition 2009: 2%
- Code of Practice for CKC Member Breeders: 57%
- Other (please specify): 21%]

The ‘other, please specify’ category contained 92 responses. The summary of the main themes are:

- 60 respondents follow other breed club or other club guidelines.
- 18 respondents follow their own which are above and beyond anything out there, created from various sources: experience, vets, other management practices.
- 8 respondents consider their dogs part of their family and their standards are well above anything out there.
- A few others use municipal by-laws, vets advice or consider peer policing of your dogs as a good guide.
Question 18: Have you created your own breeding procedures or other operational procedures?

*total responses = 283

The ‘other, please specify’ category contained 31 responses. The summary of the main themes are:

- 15 respondents added they use their own experience, ongoing education, other breeders experience to make sure they have the best operation possible.
- 3 respondents prepare contracts, interviews and questionnaires for buyers/adopters.
- 1 also uses veterinarian’s advice.

Question 19: On a scale of 1 (lowest) to 10 (highest), what is your level of concern about animal welfare as it relates to the dog and cat breeding industry in B.C.?

*total responses = 281
Question 20: When thinking about your animal welfare concerns in the dog and cat breeding industry, rank the following list to show where the B.C. government should put the most focus when developing standards of care.

This is a high level list; each topic can contain many sub-issues. For example "Food and Water" may include: access, proper food storage, food logs/record keeping and others. The scale is: Not at all important (1), Not important (2), Neutral/No opinion (3), Important (4), Most important (5).

*total responses = 276

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food and water</td>
<td>4.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment and prevention of illness or injury</td>
<td>4.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation</td>
<td>4.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Containment and shelter</td>
<td>4.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socialization of animals</td>
<td>4.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breeding</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care provided by supervisory staff</td>
<td>4.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>4.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euthanasia</td>
<td>3.96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Question 21: Do you have any other animal welfare concerns in the dog and cat breeding industry that are important to you, but did not appear on the list above?

*total responses = 260

- 117 did not list additional animal welfare concerns.
- The remaining 143 responses were grouped into the following common themes:
  - Target puppy mills, irresponsible breeders, designer dogs or those that breed for profit.
  - Importance of health tests, genetic testing, socialization and mental stimulation for resulting welfare of offspring.
  - Welfare would improve with proper education, training and enforcement of new rules, or using the existing rules more effectively.
  - Generally not accepting of government interference or a reduction of rights in an arbitrary way that could push out small scale breeders.
  - Target or make rules applicable to: sales in pet stores, rescues, shelters, importation, groomers, vets, all animals and catteries.
  - Appropriate numbers of animals, litters, ages of breeding, duration of breeding.
  - Some indicated microchips or mandatory identification of puppies, addition of purchasing contracts, owner’s ability, choosing homes as ways to improve welfare.
**Question 22: Do you agree or disagree with these potential advantages to creating regulatory standards of care for dog and cat breeders?**

*total responses = 248*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Advantage</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provides information for breeders make good decisions and produce the best offspring</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Will Increase consumer confidence in breeders</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides breeders with information that can be used as training for staff</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improves animal welfare</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifies breeders that are not providing minimum standards of care</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards of care can be used as part of proactive education and outreach programs to those...</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clearly communicates the minimum standards of care required for B.C. breeders</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

68 respondents chose to add extra opinion in ‘Other potential advantages please specify’ to creating regulatory standards of care. The following are common themes:

- 18 respondents stated that a new Act could not get bad breeders
- 16 saw no advantages at all
- 6 respondents thought inspection of some type may make it work
- 5 respondents want to use existing Act in a more effective way
- 4 respondents felt that increasing education would improve the current situation
- 4 respondents felt that any new Act would have the effect of penalizing good breeders
- Single responses included: expand idea to all animals, health tests are important, consider microchips, prevent selling in stores and online, make sure socialization is included, target large scale operations, overall too restrictive, issues with vaccination, use breeders as mentors.
Question 23: Do you agree or disagree with these potential disadvantages to creating regulatory standards of care for dog and cat breeders?

*total responses = 248

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Potential Disadvantage</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>May not address the issue of irresponsible breeders</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does not recognize breeders who consistently exceed minimum standards</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limits personal freedom and choices</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased cost burden to breeders: potential facility upgrades or other implementation activity</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breeding is too complex for a standardized approach to animal care</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased paperwork requirement</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard is a minimum and will be too low to have any effect on animal welfare</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

79 respondents chose to add ‘Other potential disadvantages, please specify’ to creating regulatory standards of care. The following are common themes:

- 26 stated the disadvantage is bad breeders will not follow any rules; therefore the system would be ineffective.
- 16 stated the added burden of standards that add no value would cause good breeders to go out of business or move away.
- 12 stated the disadvantages lie in implementation of the regulation and enforcement problems, including not trusting SPCA, no competent resources, no financing.
- 3 stated the disadvantage is the standard would be too general, or could not accommodate home raised litters.
- 3 stated they welcome the approach provided there is consideration for small scale breeders.
- 2 stated that the breeders are not the problem, it is the sales side that is the driver of puppy mills and bad breeding.
- 1 stated that education would be most useful in getting results.
- 1 stated that government oversight is not required.
Question 24: How do you think irresponsible breeders will be found? [select all that apply]

*total responses = 243

106 respondents chose to include additional ways irresponsible breeders could be found in the ‘Other, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 22 chose to restate using complaints from public, neighbours, service people and others.
- 17 state that the best way to find them are to use some form of inspection.
- 16 think that irresponsible breeders will never be found or stopped.
- 16 state active monitoring of internet and other advertisements and sales channels will uncover most irresponsible breeders.
- 8 state increasing education or public awareness is helpful.
- 6 state veterinarians can be involved in identifying issues related to puppies or kittens that is a result of poor breeding conditions.
- 4 state using microchips for all puppies is useful to track back to breeders when health problems arise.
- 4 think that there could be a proliferation of fake complaints against breeders because of personal vendettas, or anti-breeding stances.
- Remainder of comments ask to enforce existing laws, make new laws applicable to pet stores and shelters, set laws for sales of puppies, fix problems with importing dogs and cats, monitor volume of offspring or animals on premises as a red flag and to continue to work with good breeders.
**Question 25: Are there higher risk breeder categories which require more oversight?**

*total responses = 243*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Breeders with existing record of animal welfare inspections</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High volume producers</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Typically aggressive dog breeds</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dogs or cats that may have specific welfare needs (e.g. prone to respiratory problems, short/no hair, very large or very small)</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operations that only or also keep male dogs</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operations that only or also keep male cats</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

55 respondents chose to include additional comments in ‘Other, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 17 stated look at popular breeds in demand, mixed breeds or designer dogs/cats.
- Other comments related to: rescues and import organizations, specific health issues, age of female, frequency of litters, number of employees or income, monitor people with existing complaints, large numbers for sale, those not registered with a breed club, older or sick animals that are being bred, monitor those that don’t use sales contracts or sell online or at retail locations.
Question 26: In what ways will animal welfare at breeding establishments improve if British Columbia strengthens regulatory oversight of dog and cat breeding?

*total responses = 239

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Helps to identify those breeders that are not meeting minimum standards of care</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helps the public to understand and choose responsible breeders</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides an opportunity to educate breeders that are not compliant</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enables inspections to determine compliance with the standards of care</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring breeding activities will help animal welfare authorities deal with irresponsible...</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved record keeping will help breeders identify problem areas that can be improved</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improves communications between breeders and animal welfare authorities</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

52 respondents chose to include additional comments in ‘Other, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 18 stated target mills in some way and this new law will only negatively impact good breeders.
- 11 stated without compliance and enforcement inspections the new law will not work.
- 9 stated that government should not do this or there will be no improvements.
- 6 stated improve through more public education on animal ownership in general.
- Remaining comments relate to: fixing current laws and enforcing them, limit number of litters per year, recognize good breeders, record keeping, target rescue groups bringing in dogs from all over the world and bio-security concerns about inspectors transferring diseases.
**Question 27:** What are the weaknesses of improving regulatory oversight of dog and cat breeding?

*total responses = 239*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Weakness</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of confidence in the ability to set up an appropriate compliance and enforcement program</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any system would lack the flexibility to be effective for all breeders</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Will be ineffective at identifying and stopping irresponsible breeders from operating in B.C.</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does not control the demand for puppies and kittens which is what drives irresponsible breeding behavior</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

61 respondents chose to include additional comments in ‘*Other, please specify*’ category. The following are common themes:

- 14 stated that the main weakness will be lack of good compliance and enforcement.
- 18 stated it won’t stop bad breeders, will make them go underground further, it will simply discourage good breeders, and the demand will be filled by bad breeders.
- Other comments related to addressing animal welfare and issue of imports, rescue agencies, sales in pet stores, including a hobby breeder category, sales through brokers, more education, limit number of breeding animals, fix and use existing laws, use microchips as a way to further monitor sales, make sure any standard is able to be updated once new information is available.
Question 28: Are you willing to pay for registration and/or licensing?

*total responses = 237

86 respondents chose to include additional comments in ‘Other, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 49 stated they already pay through a breed club.
- 13 stated they are not supportive.
- 8 stated willingness depends on cost.
- 6 stated yes they are willing to pay.
- 4 stated look at no cost for small scale breeders.
- 3 suggested using CKC fee as the licence fee.
- The remaining comments related to making sure there is a stiff penalty for not paying, paying for registration of licensing will take away money needed to care for animals, and the irresponsible breeders will not pay.
Question 29: What is the maximum you would be willing to pay?

*total responses = 237

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Under $100</td>
<td>25.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$100 - $200</td>
<td>12.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$200 - $300</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$300 - $400</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$400 - $500</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other amount (please specify)</td>
<td>32.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

78 respondents chose to answer ‘Other amount, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 43 stated they are not willing to pay any amount.
- 12 indicated payment should be based on volume.
- 11 stated they did not know the amount they are willing to pay.
- 8 stated they would pay a small amount or a one-time payment.
- 2 stated they are willing to pay any amount.
- 1 stated that they would pay any amount that covers enforcement.
Question 30: In what ways will your breeding business be positively impacted by improving regulatory oversight of dog and cat breeding in British Columbia?

*total responses = 229

- Provides customers with a way to independently verify that breeders that are in compliance
  - Agree: 97
  - Disagree: 100
  - Not applicable: 32

- Consumers are empowered to determine how to choose a responsible breeder
  - Agree: 96
  - Disagree: 102
  - Not applicable: 31

- Provides an easy way to inform customers that my business is following the standards of care
  - Agree: 94
  - Disagree: 98
  - Not applicable: 37

- Breeder’s operational choices can be based on consistent, quality information
  - Agree: 84
  - Disagree: 102
  - Not applicable: 43

50 respondents chose to make additional comments ‘Other positive impacts, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 18 stated there will be no positive advantages.
- 4 stated they are not supportive.
- 2 stated that licences will add authority to puppy mill locations
- 4 stated inspections are a requirement otherwise it will be ineffective, and to focus on bad breeders.
- Remainder of comments were not applicable to the question.
Question 31: In what ways will your breeding business be negatively impacted by improving regulatory oversight of dog and cat breeding in British Columbia?

*total responses = 229

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Animal welfare may not improve if irresponsible breeders operate under the table</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New registration and/or licensing fees will add to much cost to breeding businesses</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My freedom of choice is being limited</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Added cost to business because I may have to make operational changes based on standards of care</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It will take time to comply and I don’t think I can manage the changes</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

64 respondents chose to make additional comments ‘Other negative impacts, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 34 stated it will either penalize good breeders, or it will not get at bad breeders and they will go further underground.
- 5 stated they are not supportive.
- 5 stated they wanted recognition for small or hobby breeders.
- The remaining comments related to cost to government, new law would reduce freedom of choice, any standards created would be inferior and there is already too much regulation.
**Question 32:** Thinking about your experiences, which concept would be most acceptable to dog and cat breeders in British Columbia?

*total responses = 224

- Mandatory registration: 51%
- Mandatory licensing: 10%
- Mandatory registration for all breeding activity and licensing for higher risk activities: 39%

**Question 33:** What type of education and outreach works best for dog and cat breeders?

*total responses = 220

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interactive, online</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In person workshop</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passive, online</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newsletters</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mail outs</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspaper</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

53 respondents chose to make additional comments ‘Other methods, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 11 stated they use clubs for education, or clubs could be used to distribute education material.
- 11 stated education not effective it is not needed.
- 8 stated to use dog shows as a venue and breeders as knowledgeable experts.
- 6 were generally not supportive.
- 3 stated television and radio spots may be effective.
- The remaining comments ranged from: fix existing rules, education is ineffective on bad breeders, use a series of public forums or workshops that start before final regulations are done, and focus education on buyers.
**Question 34:** What is the best way to reach out to breeders who will be hesitant to implement mandatory standards of care?

*total responses = 220*

- 19 stated trying to reach out to bad breeders will not work.
- 10 stated that clubs are a good way to communicate.
- 3 stated spend more time on investigation, fines or prosecutions.
- 4 stated again that responding to and monitoring online ads would work.
- The remaining comments suggested that all-breed shows and veterinarians are a good way to reach out.
Question 35: Which training topics related to improved regulatory oversight of breeders would be most important to you?
Scale: Not at all important (1), Not important (2), Neutral/No opinion (3), Important (4), Most important (5).

*total responses = 217

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Training Topic</th>
<th>Importance Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understanding the process to follow to be in compliance with any new system the government implements</td>
<td>3.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General training sessions on any new standards of care and any new registration and/or licensing system</td>
<td>3.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparing for an inspection</td>
<td>3.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding how implementing standards of care impacts my business</td>
<td>3.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ways to implement standards of care</td>
<td>3.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

39 respondents chose to make additional comments ‘Other training topics, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 16 stated training is not needed or wanted by good breeders, may be useful to new breeders.
- 5 stated that training is not effective at getting to bad breeders.
- 3 stated they are interested in particular requirements needed for regulatory compliance.
- The remaining comments related to: dog training for new owners, how to find good homes, health tests, rights during inspections.
**Question 36: Which animal welfare education topics, that could be offered in training sessions, are most important to dog and cat breeders?**

This is a high level list; each topic can contain many sub-issues. For example "Food and Water" may include: access, proper food storage, food logs/record keeping and others.

Scale: Not at all important (1), Not important (2), Neutral/No opinion (3), Important (4), Most important (5).

*total responses = 207*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Scale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Treatment and prevention of illness or injury</td>
<td>3.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socialization of animals</td>
<td>3.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation</td>
<td>3.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Containment and shelter</td>
<td>3.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food and water</td>
<td>3.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breeding</td>
<td>3.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All topics presented in a package</td>
<td>3.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care provided by supervisory staff</td>
<td>3.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>3.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euthanasia</td>
<td>3.50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

44 respondents chose to make additional comments ‘Other topics, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 22 stated they are highly trained or educated and already know what to do.
- 7 stated training would be ineffective for bad breeders.
- 3 stated there should be recognition for small, in home breeders.
- The remaining topics ranged from: health tests, temperament, socialization, obedience training, focus training on public, make sure any trainer is qualified and using microchips.
Question 37: Which elements are the most important to include in public outreach campaigns?
Scale: Not at all important (1), Not important (2), Neutral/No opinion (3), Important (4), Most important (5).

*total responses = 201

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How to make a responsible decision when buying a puppy and/or kitten</td>
<td>4.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What questions should I ask a breeder</td>
<td>4.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What mandatory standards of care to look for when visiting or selecting a breeder</td>
<td>4.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General knowledge and increased understanding of animal welfare</td>
<td>3.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spay/neutering benefits, including any low cost options</td>
<td>3.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effect of consumer demand in breeding industry</td>
<td>3.68</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

43 respondents chose to make additional comments ‘Other elements for public outreach, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 13 stated good breeders and clubs already are educating public and information is out there.
- 11 stated importance of updating information on spaying and neutering, science is changing.
- 6 stated train people in general pet ownership responsibility, how to recognize health, importance of socialization.
- 4 stated ban sales in pet stores and issues related to rescuing dogs.
- The remaining comments suggested: how to recognize good breeders and the importance of a sales contract.
Question 38: Do you think your customers would be interested in seeing simplified reports on inspection outcomes?

*total responses = 201

42 respondents chose to make additional comments ‘Other, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 17 stated their buyers can see for themselves or they already provide this type of information.
- 9 reiterated ‘no they would not be interested’.
- 6 were not sure or maybe would be interested.
- The remaining comments ranged from: breeding is not a business, unsupportive of government intervention, would never allow inspections on my property and it will not help.
Question 39: Do you think strengthening regulatory oversight of dog and cat breeders will improve the public’s ability to make good choices when selecting dogs and cats?

*total responses = 201

42 respondents chose to make additional comments ‘Other, please specify’ category. The following are common themes:

- 26 stated it will not be effective.
- 4 stated yes it would be effective.
- 4 stated make public aware of problems that come from adopting from rescues and buying from stores.
- The remaining comments suggested: require a licence to own a pet, focus on public education, would be effective if there is oversight and make adequate standards.

Question 40: Please provide new, additional comments you may have related to dog and cat breeding standards of care, a registration system and/or a licensing system.

*total responses = 190

109 respondents chose to raise other topics or issues they felt were important for the ministry to consider. The following are common themes:

- 48 stated regulating breeders will not be effective at stopping irresponsible breeding and that no government intervention is needed.
- 11 stated using existing laws better may be more efficient.
- 11 stated there should be a ban on sales in pet stores and rescues need to be monitored.
- 6 stated that inspections must accompany any new law or it will not be effective.
- The remaining comments ranged from: recognition of hobby breeders, bio-security concerns, privacy concerns, focus on public education and responsible ownership, write a new standard of care, exclude cropping and docking, don’t mandate spaying or neutering, incentives for good breeders, work with CKC and take your time to do it right.